

## Two notions of causal sufficiency Formal machinery

Rebekah Baglini (Aarhus University)  
Elitzur A. Bar-Asher Siegal (Hebrew University of Jerusalem)

**Definition 1 (Causal Structure):** A causal structure of a set of proposition letters  $\mathcal{P}$  is a directed acyclic graph (DAG) in which each node corresponds to a distinct element of  $\mathcal{P}$ , and each link represents direct functional relationship among the corresponding propositions.

**Definition 2 (Causal Model):** A causal model is a pair  $M = \langle D, \Theta_D \rangle$  consisting of a causal structure  $D$  and a set of parameters  $\Theta_D$  compatible with  $D$ . The parameters  $\Theta_D$  assign a function  $\psi_i = f_i(\Sigma)$  to each  $\psi_i \in \mathcal{P}$ , where  $\Sigma$  is the set of all nodes that  $\psi_i$  causally depends on in  $D$ .

**Definition 3 (Truth values generated by a causal model):** Let  $\mathcal{P}$  be a set of proposition letters and  $\mathcal{L}$  the closure of  $\mathcal{P}$  under conjunction and negation. Furthermore, let  $M = \langle D, \Theta_D \rangle$  be a causal model for  $\mathcal{P}$ , and  $I : \Sigma \rightarrow \{0, 1\}$  an interpretation of a set of variables  $\Sigma$  of  $M$ . For arbitrary  $\psi \in \mathcal{L}$  we define the interpretation of  $\psi$  with respect to  $M$  and  $I$ ,  $[[\psi]]^{M,I}$  recursively as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} [[\psi]]^{M,I} &= I(\psi), \text{ if } \psi \in \Sigma, \\ [[\psi]]^{M,I} &= [[F(\psi)]]^{M,I}, \text{ if } \psi \in \mathcal{P} - \Sigma \\ [[\neg\psi]]^{M,I} &= 1, \text{ iff } [[\psi]]^{M,I} = 0 \text{ and} \\ [[\psi \wedge \phi]]^{M,I} &= 1, \text{ iff } [[\psi]]^{M,I} = 1 \text{ and } [[\phi]]^{M,I} = 1. \end{aligned}$$

**Definition 4 (Situation):** A set of pairs of propositional variable  $\Sigma$  in  $\mathcal{P}$  and their values is a situation.

**Definition 5 (Causal relevance):** A situation  $s$  (consisting of a set of pairs of propositional variables  $\Sigma$  in  $\mathcal{P}$  and their values) of  $M$  is causally relevant for a certain value of the variable  $\psi$ , when the interpretation of  $\psi$  with respect to  $M$  and  $I$  is defined (1 or 0), when  $I : \Sigma^c$  (the complementary set of  $\Sigma$  in  $\mathcal{P}$ ) assigns  $u$  for all its members.

**Definition 6 (Causal necessity):**  $\chi$  is causally necessary for a certain value of  $\psi$  in a situation  $s$ , i.e. the variable and its value in  $s$  ( $S\chi$ ) is necessary for a certain value of  $\psi$  (0 or 1) if: There is a set of propositional variables  $\Sigma$  and there are two situations  $s$  and  $s'$ , which are two situations of  $\Sigma$ , such that

- i. the situation  $s$  is causally relevant for a propositional variable  $\psi$
- ii.  $I : \Sigma \rightarrow \{0, 1\}$  is an interpretation of the set of variables  $\Sigma$  of  $M$ , in situation  $s$  and  $I' : \Sigma \rightarrow \{0, 1\}$  an interpretation of the set of variables  $\Sigma$  of  $M$ , in situation  $s'$  and
- iii.  $s(\chi) \neq s'(\chi)$ .
- iv. The cardinality of the complementary set  $J$ , such that  $J = s - s'$  is 2, and the two members of  $J$  are the pair of  $\chi$  and its value, different in each pair, and
- v.  $[[\psi]]^{M,I} \neq [[\psi]]^{M,I'}$ , and
- vi. There is no interpretation  $I''$  of the set of variables  $\Sigma$ , in which  $s'(\chi) = s''(\chi)$  and  $[[\psi]]^{M,I'} \neq [[\psi]]^{M,I''}$ .

**Definition 7 (Sufficient set):** A situation  $s$  is defined as a sufficient set for a certain interpretation of  $\psi$ , if the set of propositions  $\Sigma$  whose value are defined in  $s$ , is causally relevant for the proposition  $\psi$ , and all members of  $S$  are causally necessary for  $\psi$ .  
 $\{X \in s \mid \text{such that } x \text{ is causally necessary for } \psi\}$

**Definition 8 (A completed sufficient set):** A situation  $s$  is the completed sufficient for a certain interpretation of  $\psi$ , which is the superset of all comparable sufficient sets.

(1) **Overt cause**

$$\exists Q \exists R \exists e \exists \Sigma : \text{SUFF}(\Sigma, R)^M = 1 \ \& \ (Q \in \Sigma^M) \ \& \ \Sigma(e) \ \& \ \forall \Omega [ (\Omega \neq \Sigma) \ \& \ \text{SUFF}(\Omega, R)^M = 1 \rightarrow \neg \Omega(e) ]$$

(2) **Lexical causative - Take 1**

$$\exists Q \exists R \exists e \exists t \exists \Sigma : \text{SUFF}(\Sigma, R)^M = 1 \ \& \ (Q \in \Sigma^M) \ \& \ \Sigma(e) \ \& \ \tau(e) \subseteq t \ \& \ \forall t' < t \ \forall e' : \tau(e') \subseteq t' \rightarrow [\neg Q(e')] \ \& \ \forall \Omega [ (\Omega \neq \Sigma) \ \& \ \text{SUFF}(\Omega, R)^M = 1 \rightarrow \neg \Omega(e) ]$$

(3) **Lexical causative - Take 2 (Completed sufficient set)**

$$\exists Q \exists R \exists e \exists t \exists \Sigma \exists Y : \text{SUFF}(\Sigma, R)^M = 1 \ \& \ \text{COMPSUFF}(Y, R)^M = 1 \ \& \ (Q \in \Sigma^M) \ \& \ (Q \in Y^M) \ \& \ \Sigma(e) \ \& \ \tau(e) \subseteq t \ \& \ \forall t' < t \ \forall e' : \tau(e') \subseteq t' \rightarrow [\neg Q(e')] \ \& \ \forall \Omega [ (\Omega \neq Y) \ \& \ \text{COMPSUFF}(\Omega, R)^M = 1 \rightarrow \neg \Omega(e) ]$$